

Understanding the Digital World

Telecom & Over-The-Top



# Net Neutrality

International benchmark: how are telcos, content providers & regulators positioning themselves

M14116 – April 2014

- This document is a part of our "Telecom & Over-The-Top" category which includes in 2014:
  - 1 dataset in Excel, updated yearly
  - 1 state-of-the-art report in PowerPoint, updated yearly
  - 6 market reports in Word, each with its synopsis in PowerPoint
  - Privileged access to our lead Expert Telecom & Over-The-Top analysts

**Author : Vincent BONNEAU, Head of the Internet Business Unit**



Vincent Bonneau is IDATE's chief expert on fixed and mobile Internet services and software innovation. He is the head of the Internet Business Unit which tackles issues surrounding the Web and emerging technologies, and especially services, markets, usage and monetisation aspects. Vincent's particular specialty is detecting and analysing innovations. Before coming to IDATE, Vincent worked in the software and telecom industries. He was the "Internet Software and Technologies" attache to the French Trade Commission (DREE) in San Francisco, in addition to having gained strategic operational and marketing experience working for Noos, Wanadoo and France Telecom in Paris. Mr. Bonneau is a graduate of the Ecole Polytechnical (1997) and the Ecole Nationale Superieure des Telecommunications (2002), and holds a Masters Degree in New Technologies Management from the HEC business school (2002). He can be reached at: [v.bonneau@idate.org](mailto:v.bonneau@idate.org)  
[v.bonneau@idate.org](mailto:v.bonneau@idate.org)

**Contributors**

**Soichi NAKAJIMA, Senior consultant**

**Christoph PENNINGS, Senior consultant**

**About IDATE and DigiWorld Institute**



Founded in 1977, IDATE has gained a reputation as a leader in tracking telecom, Internet and media markets, thanks to the skills of its teams of specialized analysts. Now, with the support of more than 40 member companies – which include many of the digital economy's most influential players – the newly rebranded DigiWorld Institute has entered into a new stage of its development, structured around three main areas of activity:

- **IDATE Research**, an offer of market intelligence publications
- **IDATE Consulting**, time-tested analysis
- **DigiWorld Institute**, a think tank on the digital economy.



Contact us for further information on our publications

Isabel Jimenez

P: +33 (0)467 144 404 - F: +33 (0)467 144 400 - [i.jimenez@idate.org](mailto:i.jimenez@idate.org)

# Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1. Executive Summary .....</b>                                 | <b>9</b>  |
| <b>2. Methodology &amp; definitions .....</b>                     | <b>13</b> |
| 2.1. General methodology of IDATE's reports .....                 | 13        |
| 2.2. What is Net Neutrality? .....                                | 14        |
| <b>3. Status of Net neutrality around the world.....</b>          | <b>15</b> |
| 3.1. Overall view .....   | 15        |
| 3.2. Summary of wireline telcos .....                             | 19        |
| 3.3. Summary of mobile telcos.....                                | 21        |
| 3.4. Summary of regulation .....                                  | 23        |
| 3.5. Summary of content and service providers.....                | 25        |
| 3.6. Evolution of net neutrality; a review of 2013 .....          | 26        |
| <b>4. Australia.....</b>  | <b>28</b> |
| 4.1. Wireline telcos .....  | 28        |
| 4.1.1. Technical measures employed.....                           | 28        |
| 4.1.2. Statements .....   | 29        |
| 4.1.3. Broadband network (NBN) .....                              | 30        |
| 4.2. Mobile telcos.....   | 31        |
| 4.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                             | 31        |
| 4.2.2. Statements .....   | 31        |
| 4.3. Regulation.....  | 31        |
| 4.4. Content and service providers.....                           | 33        |
| <b>5. Canada .....</b>  | <b>35</b> |
| 5.1. Wireline telcos .....  | 35        |
| 5.1.1. Technical measures employed.....                           | 35        |
| 5.1.2. Change in policy, from throttling to non-throttling .....  | 36        |
| 5.1.3. Statements .....   | 38        |
| 5.2. Mobile telcos.....   | 40        |
| 5.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                             | 40        |
| 5.2.2. Statements .....   | 40        |
| 5.3. Regulation.....  | 40        |
| 5.3.1. Initiatives from the regulator (CRTC) .....                | 40        |
| 5.3.2. Parliamentary initiatives .....                            | 42        |
| 5.3.3. Legal cases .....  | 43        |
| 5.4. Content and service providers.....                           | 44        |
| 5.4.1. Google introduces "Video Quality Report" .....             | 44        |
| 5.4.2. The players' positions with respect to Net neutrality..... | 45        |

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>6. The United States</b> .....                                 | <b>46</b> |
| <b>6.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                                 | <b>46</b> |
| 6.1.1. Technical measures employed .....                          | 46        |
| 6.1.2. Statements .....   | 50        |
| 6.1.3. Piracy in the United States .....                          | 53        |
| <b>6.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                                   | <b>54</b> |
| 6.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                             | 54        |
| 6.2.2. Statements .....   | 57        |
| <b>6.3. Regulation</b> .....                                      | <b>58</b> |
| 6.3.1. Initiatives from the regulator (FCC) .....                 | 58        |
| 6.3.2. Bills .....  | 60        |
| 6.3.3. 700 MHz spectrum .....                                     | 60        |
| 6.3.4. President Obama's position .....                           | 61        |
| 6.3.5. Legal cases .....  | 61        |
| <b>6.4. Content and service providers</b> .....                   | <b>64</b> |
| <b>7. Europe</b> .....  | <b>67</b> |
| <b>7.1. Regulation</b> .....                                      | <b>67</b> |
| <b>7.2. CEO Roundtable proposals</b> .....                        | <b>70</b> |
| <b>7.3. Slovenia and the Czech Republic</b> .....                 | <b>71</b> |
| <b>8. France</b> .....  | <b>72</b> |
| <b>8.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                                 | <b>72</b> |
| 8.1.1. Technical measures employed .....                          | 72        |
| 8.1.2. DNS hijacking .....  | 73        |
| 8.1.3. The five French ISPs versus Google (YouTube) .....         | 75        |
| 8.1.4. Free blocks all Google ads .....                           | 75        |
| 8.1.5. Statements .....   | 75        |
| <b>8.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                                   | <b>77</b> |
| 8.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                             | 77        |
| 8.2.2. Statements .....   | 78        |
| <b>8.3. Regulation</b> .....                                      | <b>79</b> |
| 8.3.1. Regulator (ARCEP) .....                                    | 79        |
| 8.3.2. Draft legislation .....                                    | 80        |
| 8.3.3. Legal cases and proceedings .....                          | 82        |
| <b>8.4. Content and service providers</b> .....                   | <b>83</b> |
| <b>9. Germany</b> .....   | <b>85</b> |
| <b>9.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                                 | <b>85</b> |
| 9.1.1. Technical measures employed .....                          | 85        |
| 9.1.2. Statements .....   | 86        |
| <b>9.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                                   | <b>87</b> |
| 9.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                             | 87        |
| 9.2.2. Statements .....   | 88        |
| <b>9.3. Regulation</b> .....                                      | <b>88</b> |
| 9.3.1. Position of the federal ministry of economics (BMWi) ..... | 88        |
| 9.3.2. The regulator's position (BNetzA) .....                    | 89        |
| 9.3.3. Other regulatory elements .....                            | 89        |
| 9.3.4. Legal cases .....  | 90        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>10. Italy</b> .....                            | <b>93</b>  |
| <b>10.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                | <b>93</b>  |
| 10.1.1. Technical measures employed.....          | 93         |
| 10.1.2. Statements concerning Net neutrality..... | 94         |
| <b>10.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                  | <b>95</b>  |
| 10.2.1. Differentiation measures .....            | 95         |
| 10.2.2. Statements .....                          | 95         |
| <b>10.3. Regulation</b> .....                     | <b>96</b>  |
| 10.3.1. The regulator’s position .....            | 96         |
| 10.3.2. Political positions.....                  | 97         |
| 10.3.3. Legal cases .....                         | 97         |
| <b>10.4. Content and service providers</b> .....  | <b>99</b>  |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>11. The Netherlands</b> .....                  | <b>100</b> |
| <b>11.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                | <b>100</b> |
| 11.1.1. Technical measures employed.....          | 100        |
| 11.1.2. Billing systems.....                      | 100        |
| <b>11.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                  | <b>101</b> |
| <b>11.3. Regulation</b> .....                     | <b>102</b> |
| <b>11.4. Content and service providers</b> .....  | <b>103</b> |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>12. Norway</b> .....                           | <b>104</b> |
| <b>12.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                | <b>104</b> |
| 12.1.1. Technical measures employed.....          | 104        |
| 12.1.2. The case of NextGenTel .....              | 105        |
| 12.1.3. Statements .....                          | 105        |
| <b>12.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                  | <b>106</b> |
| 12.2.1. Differentiation measures .....            | 106        |
| 12.2.2. Statements .....                          | 106        |
| <b>12.3. Regulation</b> .....                     | <b>107</b> |
| <b>12.4. Service and content providers</b> .....  | <b>108</b> |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>13. Spain</b> .....                            | <b>109</b> |
| <b>13.1. Wireline telcos</b> .....                | <b>109</b> |
| 13.1.1. Technical measures employed.....          | 109        |
| 13.1.2. Statements .....                          | 109        |
| 13.1.3. Billing system .....                      | 110        |
| <b>13.2. Mobile telcos</b> .....                  | <b>111</b> |
| 13.2.1. Differentiation measures .....            | 111        |
| 13.2.2. Statements .....                          | 111        |
| <b>13.3. Regulation</b> .....                     | <b>112</b> |
| <b>13.4. Content and service providers</b> .....  | <b>113</b> |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>14. The United Kingdom .....</b>  | <b>114</b> |
| <b>14.1. Wireline telcos .....</b>   | <b>114</b> |
| 14.1.1. Technical measures employed .....                                  | 114        |
| 14.1.2. Virgin Media offering Netflix with no traffic management.....      | 116        |
| 14.1.3. Statements .....   | 117        |
| <b>14.2. Mobile telcos.....</b>  | <b>118</b> |
| 14.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                                     | 118        |
| 14.2.2. Traffic management .....   | 119        |
| 14.2.3. Statements .....   | 120        |
| <b>14.3. Regulation.....</b>   | <b>122</b> |
| 14.3.1. The regulator's position .....                                     | 122        |
| 14.3.2. The government's position .....                                    | 125        |
| 14.3.3. Legal cases .....  | 125        |
| <b>14.4. Content and service providers.....</b>                            | <b>126</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>15. Japan.....</b>  | <b>128</b> |
| <b>15.1. Wireline telcos .....</b>   | <b>128</b> |
| 15.1.1. Technical measures employed .....                                  | 128        |
| 15.1.2. Statements .....   | 129        |
| <b>15.2. Mobile telcos.....</b>  | <b>129</b> |
| 15.2.1. Differentiation measures .....                                     | 129        |
| 15.2.2. Statements .....   | 131        |
| <b>15.3. Regulation.....</b>   | <b>131</b> |
| 15.3.1. Introduction: ISP competition in Japan is deemed healthy .....     | 131        |
| 15.3.2. The MIC Working Group on Net Neutrality .....                      | 132        |
| 15.3.3. Guidelines for packet shaping .....                                | 132        |
| 15.3.4. Conclusion: no specific regulation, guidelines are sufficient..... | 133        |
| 15.3.5. Law enforcement on piracy .....                                    | 133        |
| <b>15.4. Content and service providers.....</b>                            | <b>134</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>16. South Korea.....</b>  | <b>135</b> |
| <b>16.1. Wireline telcos .....</b>   | <b>135</b> |
| <b>16.2. Mobile telcos.....</b>  | <b>136</b> |
| <b>16.3. Regulation.....</b>   | <b>137</b> |
| <b>16.4. Content and service providers.....</b>                            | <b>138</b> |

## Tables & Figures

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
| Table 1:  | Synthesis of the Net neutrality debate relating to fixed networks.....        | 17  |
| Table 2:  | Synthesis of the Net neutrality debate relating to mobile networks.....       | 18  |
| Table 3:  | Differentiation practices on fixed networks.....                              | 20  |
| Table 4:  | Differentiation practices on mobile networks.....                             | 22  |
| Table 5:  | Status of regulatory debates and policies .....                               | 24  |
| Table 6:  | Content and service providers' positions with respect to Net neutrality ..... | 26  |
| Table 7:  | Excerpt from CRTC's 2012-15 work plan.....                                    | 42  |
| Table 8:  | Dissatisfaction of users by ISP and service (% of respondents) .....          | 82  |
| Table 9:  | ISP Get: flat rate plans segmented by connection speed .....                  | 104 |
| Table 10: | Recap of data plan prices as of February 2010 .....                           | 112 |
| Table 11: | Allowable use of the word "unlimited" according to Ofcom .....                | 124 |

\*\*\*

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| Figure 1:  | The key Net neutrality issues along the video distribution value chain .....                                | 10  |
| Figure 2:  | New sources of income for telcos .....  | 12  |
| Figure 3:  | Classes of service proposed for Australia's NBN.....  | 30  |
| Figure 4:  | List of ISPs who offer unmetered access to ABC iview service .....  | 34  |
| Figure 5:  | Rogers' traffic management policy (current, after CTRC intervention in 2012).....                           | 36  |
| Figure 6:  | Rogers' traffic management policy (before CTRC intervention in 2012).....                                   | 37  |
| Figure 7:  | Bell Canada's traffic management policy (before CTRC intervention in 2012) .....                            | 37  |
| Figure 8:  | Bell Canada's traffic management policy (current, after CTRC intervention in 2012) .....                    | 38  |
| Figure 9:  | CRTC letter to Rogers (Jan. 20, 2012) .....   | 43  |
| Figure 10: | Google's Video Quality Report launched in Janaury 2014.....   | 44  |
| Figure 11: | Evolution of download throughput of select ISPs over time .....   | 48  |
| Figure 12: | Netflix performance in the United States according to customers' ISP .....                                  | 50  |
| Figure 13: | Mozilla landing page during protest .....   | 53  |
| Figure 14: | Restrictions applied within the European Union.....   | 69  |
| Figure 15: | BEREC work on net neutrality .....  | 70  |
| Figure 16: | Enablers identified by WG1 .....  | 71  |
| Figure 17: | Illustration of DNS hijacking by Orange .....   | 73  |
| Figure 18: | Message displayed on 12/01/2011 on the screens of Orange customers trying to connect to Megavideo74         |     |
| Figure 19: | Proposals contained in the Economic Affairs Committee report .....  | 81  |
| Figure 20: | TeleTu information on quality of service .....  | 98  |
| Figure 21: | Alice's current information on quality of service.....  | 98  |
| Figure 22: | Internet access plans priced by connection speed .....  | 101 |
| Figure 23: | Regulation in the Netherlands.....  | 103 |
| Figure 24: | Reasonable traffic management criteria .....  | 108 |
| Figure 25: | ONO's service bundles .....   | 110 |
| Figure 26: | Yoigo's VoIP add-on "Bono Voz IP", and the La Infinita 35 tariff which already includes this VoIP option111 |     |
| Figure 27: | Ofcom presentation on Net neutrality (2006) .....   | 122 |
| Figure 28: | Degrees of traffic management.....  | 123 |
| Figure 29: | au smart pass, video pass, book pass and song pass.....   | 131 |

## List of players studied

| Country Players   |                              |  |   |
|---|------------------------------|--|---|
| <b>Australia</b>  |                              |  |   |
| ABC   | iiNet                        | Optus  | Telstra (BigPond)                       |
| Exetel  | Internode                    | SBS  | Vodafone                                |
| Free TV Australia   | Ninemsn                      | Seven Network                                |   |
| <b>Canada</b>   |                              |  |   |
| Alliance of Canadian Cinema, Television and Radio Artists (ACTRA) | Canadian Gamers Organisation | Motion Picture Association of America (MPAA) | Shaw Communications                     |
| Bell Canada   | CBC-Radio Canada             | Netflix                                      | Skype                                   |
| BitTorrent  | Google                       | Open Internet Coalition (OIC)                | Vonage                                  |
|   |                              | Rogers Communications                        |   |
| <b>France</b>   |                              |  |   |
| Bouygues Telecom  | Free                         | Orange                                       | Skype                                   |
| Canal+  | Google (YouTube)             | PriceMinister                                | Skyrock                                 |
| Cogent  | NRJ Group                    | SFR  | TF1                                     |
| Dailymotion   |                              |  |   |
| <b>Germany</b>  |                              |  |   |
| O2  | E-Plus                       | Kabel Deutschland                            | Verband Deutscher Zeitschriftenverleger |
| ARD - ZDF   | Freenet                      | SoftEyes GmbH                                | Vodafone Germany                        |
| Deutsche Telekom  | HanseNet                     | T-Mobile                                     |   |
|   | Telekommunikation (Alice)    |  |   |
| <b>Italy</b>  |                              |  |   |
| 3 Italy   | Mediaset                     | Telecom Italia                               | Vodafone Italy                          |
| FastWeb   | Tele2                        | Telecom Italia Mobile                        | Wind                                    |
| <b>Japan</b>  |                              |  |   |
| au by KDDI  | NTT                          | SoftBank                                     |   |
| KDDI  | NTT DOCOMO                   | SoftBank Mobile                              |   |
| <b>Norway</b>   |                              |  |   |
| Mediebedriftene   | NextGenTel                   | Schibsted                                    |   |
| Netcom  | NRK                          | Telenor                                      |   |
| <b>South Korea</b>  |                              |  |   |
| KT  | LG U+                        | Samsung                                      | SK Telecom                              |
| <b>Spain</b>  |                              |  |   |
| Jazz Telecom (Jazztel)  | Orange                       | Telefonica                                   | Yoigo (Xfera Moviles)                   |
| Movistar (Telefónica from España)                                 | Redtel                       | Vodafone                                     |   |
| <b>The Netherlands</b>  |                              |  |   |
| KPN Mobile Netherlands  | Tele2                        | T-Mobile Netherlands                         | Vodafone Netherlands                    |
| NPO   |                              |  |   |
| <b>UK</b>   |                              |  |   |
| 3 UK  | ITV                          | Skype  | Virgin Media*                           |
| BBC   | O2                           | TalkTalk                                     | Virgin UK                               |
| BSkyB   | Orange UK                    | T-Mobile                                     | Vodafone                                |
| BT  | PlusNet                      | UK Music                                     |   |
| <b>USA</b>  |                              |  |   |
| Amazon  | CTIA                         | MetroPCS                                     | Time Warner                             |
| Apple   | eBay                         | Netflix                                      | T-Mobile                                |
| AT&T  | Facebook                     | Qwest  | Twitter                                 |
| BitTorrent  | Flickr                       | Skype  | Verizon Communications                  |
| Comcast   | Google                       | Sprint                                       | Vonage                                  |
| Cox Communications  | InterActiveCorp (IAC)        | Time Warner Cable                            | Yahoo!                                  |
| Craigslist  | Level 3                      |  |   |

## 2. Methodology & definitions

### 2.1. General methodology of IDATE's reports

The methods employed by IDATE's teams of analysts and consultants are based on an approach that combines:

- research and validation of data collected in the field;
- the application of classic industry and market analysis tools: segmentation, competition analysis, strategic strengths, modelling, assessment and forecasts...;
- the expertise of specialists who contribute their own analytical capabilities and those of their network of market analysts.

More specifically, the tools employed by IDATE's teams are as follows:

#### **1/ A multi-disciplinary team of full-time consultants, specialised by sector of activity**

IDATE's analyses are performed primarily by our in-house consultants, and very occasionally by freelance market analysts. This approach allows us to capitalise on our pool of expertise through teamwork, sharing knowledge, ideas, contacts, viewpoints and key data. Each report is drafted by a team of specialists, overseen by senior consultants with a proven track record in their field.

#### **2/ Primary and secondary research**

IDATE reports and databases are compiled based on primary data obtained from one-on-one interviews with the sector's decision-makers, and on secondary data which is established by cross-referencing public sources and external databases.

#### **3/ An integrated information centre sustained by a number of tools and proprietary databases**

Over the past 30 years, IDATE has established working and data organization methods and proprietary databases that trace the central chapters in the history of our sectors of expertise.

- **Companies:** IDATE's in-house data service tracks the latest news and events to come out of the top telecom, Internet and media industry companies around the globe. Innovative firms and start-ups are monitored by the market experts in the different "Practices".
- **Markets:** IDATE's databases are derived from rigorous processing of fundamental economic variables (GDP, investments, exchange rates, demographics, etc.) and their relation to decisive sector-specific and national elements (capex, national market dynamics, etc.).
- **Technologies:** IDATE's organization by Practice provides us with an efficient means of tracking innovation. IDATE's engineers ensure in-depth understanding of the changing shape of products and services and of the latest innovations in the marketplace.

#### **4/ Contents of the published reports**

Each IDATE market report details the structures and issues at play in the market being examined, the decisive forces (technologies, regulation, consumption) and the players involved. Particular emphasis is given to market assessments and forecasts, as part of the central premise. All market reports are laid out in a clear and concise manner, and illustrated with tables and graphs of key market data and trends.

The process of drafting of a market report includes the following stages:

- analysis of the information available in the in-house databases, and review of analyses performed in the recent past;
- based on a preliminary segmentation and assessment of the market, and as part of an validated interview guide, analysts conduct interviews that enable them to validate working hypotheses;
- a market model is then established, making it possible to test the hypotheses that have an impact on the market's development, and validated by a new round of interviews;

- and, finally, the report's conclusions are debated with the team responsible for the project and with expert consultants from the various fields involved;
- a final proofreading and editing/revision process, prior to the production of the final version of the report which is delivered to the client.

## **2.2. What is Net Neutrality?**

Net neutrality is the principle whereby ISPs and governments should treat all data on the Internet equally rather than discriminating or charging differentially by user, content, site, platform, application, type of attached equipment, and mode of communication. There are a few cases for which all parties tend to agree on the need for some form of traffic management (like network security) but there are even discussions on the application of certain rules such as fighting against copyright infringement.